

---

# RISK MODELING ADVISORY WORKGROUP

**Meeting Minutes – Wednesday, July 5, 2023, 1:00 PM – 2:30 PM**

Posted 7/20/23



---

Video link to meeting held on 7/5/23: <https://youtu.be/Zu84H3ty4nk>

## Committee Members Present

Jim McDougald, Staff Chief, Office of the State Fire Marshal  
Dave Winnacker, Fire California Fire Chiefs Association and the Fire Districts Association of California  
Esteban Mendoza in lieu of Deborah Halsberstadt, The Insurance Commissioner  
Nancy Watkins, Milliman  
Dore Bietz, local government  
Melissa Semcer, Office of Energy Infrastructure Safety  
Yana Valachovic California Fire Science Consortium Association  
Chris Ochoa, California Building Industry  
Robert Marshall, Fire California Fire Chiefs Association and the Fire Districts Association of California  
Max Moritz, Milliman  
Anthony Powers, California Professional Firefighters  
Terry Woodrow, local government

## Committee Members Not Present

Neil Matouka, State Planning and Research  
Carlos Camarena, Emergency Services  
Paul Glushku, Housing and Community Development  
Joe Irvin, Local Government

## CAL FIRE – Office of the State Fire Marshal

Mark Rosenburg, Research Data Manager  
Frank Bigelow, Assistant Deputy Director  
Scott Witt, Deputy Chief

### 1. CALL TO ORDER

**Jim McDougald**

- A. Welcome
  - i. Meeting was called to order at 10:30AM
- B. Roll Call/Quorum Established
  - i. Celeste Jovanovic took roll call, Neil Matouka, Carlos Camarena, Paul Glushku and Joe Irvin were not present.
- C. Agenda Review **(Motion Required/Adoption)**

<b>Motion:</b>	R. Marshall moved to accept the meeting agenda; N. Watkins seconded the motion.
----------------	---

<b>Action:</b>	All members voted to unanimously approve the motion.
----------------	--

- D. Approval of Past Meeting Minutes **(Motion Required)**

<b>Motion:</b>	N. Watkins moved to accept the meeting minutes; R. Marshal seconded the motion.
----------------	---

<b>Action:</b>	All members voted to unanimously approve the motion.
----------------	--

## 2. OLD BUSINESS

Jim McDougald

- A. Discussion and Review of Draft Risk Modeling Report
- B. Discussion around CDI comments
  - i. Have pulled out the Executive Summary, until some consensus with the workgroup.
  - ii. CDI – how to remove cost associated with CAT models and how the removal of rate is going to affect the scope of the workgroup. – legislation no real consensus
  - iii. Could possibly quantify the loss, but not actually place a dollar amount on the mitigations and without attaching a dollar amount on the home loss.
  - iv. Workgroup should be pointing out all the models and how the models work, this includes the financial parts.
  - v. Continued discussion of what models can provide and where to do mitigations and there should be a cost benefit analysis associated with these in some way.
  - vi. Charged to provide insight, but clear with what models can be used for and what they can't be used for.
    - 1. [https://content.naic.org/sites/default/files/cipr\\_report\\_wildfire\\_mitigation.pdf](https://content.naic.org/sites/default/files/cipr_report_wildfire_mitigation.pdf) link to the various ways models are used to be informative.
  - vii. Are catastrophic models appropriate to include in the Risk Modeling Workgroup Final Paper? – Vote required
    - 1. Request to place a disclaimer in paper somewhere that this report should not be used assessment on regulation or insurance pricing. – could be more problematic as those topics have been deleted in previous meetings and agreed upon.

<b>Motion:</b>	N. Watkins moved to include Catastrophic Models in the Final Report; C. Ochoa seconded the motion.
<b>Action:</b>	N. Watkins, D. Winnacker, M. Semcer, Y. Valachovic, R. Marshall, T. Woodrow, C. Ochoa, M. Mortiz, J. McDougald, D. Bietz, and A. Powers voted by a majority to approve the motion.
<b>Abstain:</b>	E. Mendoza abstained from the vote.

- viii. Full quote from website has been summarized.
  - ix. Added Relative Speed to “additional components of risk.”
  - x. Diagram on top of page 10 – change title to “Mitigating Wildfire Risk” from “Modeling Wildfire Risk”
  - xi. Discussion around “*Existing regulations also do now account for proximity to utility infrastructure, which may influence risk to properties*” – need to place in mitigations that matter and removed out of barriers.
  - xii. Section 3.1 – density does model how risk is modeled.
    - 1. Yana and Dave to sit down and discuss this and clean this up.
    - 2. Add some of research and site in the paper.
  - xiii. Section 4.2 Types of Wildfire Models – might be too specific, but still needs to be added.
- C. When adding content to the paper, add in the comments. If grammatical, this can be placed in the paper.

## 3. ROUNDTABLE

None.

Jim McDougald

## 4. PUBLIC COMMENT

None.

## 5. UPCOMING MEETING DATES FOR 2023

1. July 19, 2023, at 3:00 – 4:30 PM (Virtual)
2. July 26, 2023, at 1:00 – 2:30 PM (Virtual)

## 6. MEETING ADJOURNMENT (Motion Required)

**Jim McDougald**

<p><b>Motion:</b> D. Winnacker moved to accept the Meeting Adjournment; A. Powers seconded the motion.</p> <p><b>Action:</b> All members voted to unanimously approve the motion.</p>
---

Meeting adjournment: 2:39PM